



## Tourism Leadership Group Meeting

# NOTE OF MEETING

Tuesday 25<sup>th</sup> April 2017

*Microsoft Offices, Waverley Gate, Edinburgh*

### Present:

- Marc Crothall, STA (MC) – Chair
- David Allfrey, Royal Edin Military Tattoo (DA)
- Stephen Duncan, Historic Environment Scotland (SD)
- Paul Easto, Wilderness Scotland (PE)
- Susan Deighan, Glasgow Life (SD)
- Judy Rae, Glasgow Science Centre (JR)
- Calum Ross, British Hospitality Association (CR)
- Robert Allan, Apex Hotels (RA)
- James Stuart, Entrepreneurial Scotland (JS)
- Marina Huggett, Tourism Excellency Consultancy (MH)
- Danny Cusick, Scottish Enterprise (DC)
- Vicki Miller, VisitScotland (VM)
- Richard Walsh, Scottish Government (RW)

### In Attendance

- Caroline Warburton, STA (CW)
- Alison O'Connor, VisitScotland (AO'C)
- Caroline Bremner, Euromonitor – part
- Jeremy Golden, Euromonitor - part

### Apologies

- Stephen Leckie, Crieff Hydro (SL)
- Russell Imrie, Queensferry Hotels (RI)
- Stephen Balfour, S Lanarkshire Council / SLAED
- Chris Taylor, Highlands & Islands Enterprise (CT)
- Gordon Dewar, Edinburgh Airport (GD)
- Fiona Cook, Scottish Government (FC)
- Bettina Sizeland, Scottish Government (BS)
- Charlie Smith, VisitScotland (CS)

## 1. Welcome & Note of Previous Meeting

MC welcomed all the meeting and gave apologies from Stephen Leckie who was unable to attend due to an urgent business issue. MC welcomed Richard Walsh and Vicki Miller who were standing in for Scottish Government and VisitScotland representatives, and notified the group that Chris Taylor was leaving HIE at the end of June. The new HIE representative was still to be determined.

The note of the previous meeting was approved. Action points were discharged or discussed at the meeting.

RA provided a brief update on the response from the Scottish Apprenticeship Advisory Board (SAAB) to the Tourism Skills Group regarding representation from the tourism industry on the Board and the distribution of the £221m raised through the Apprenticeship Levy. The letter was discussed at the previous TLG. Janette Scott from Gleneagles Hotel has been invited to join the main SAAB and Robert Allan is joining the SAAB Employer Engagement Group. The SAAB intends to have influence over the £10m Flexible Workforce Development Fund.

## 2. Election of Tourism Leadership Group Chair

Stephen Leckie was elected as Chair of the Tourism Leadership Group. No other nominations or comments were received.

- Proposer: Judy Rae
- Secunder: Calum Ross

### 3. TS2020 Update on Progress

An update was circulated prior to the meeting (Paper 3). There was discussion about the following points:

**3.1 TS2020 Key Performance Indicators:** CW highlighted that the 2016 visitor spend figures were still heavily estimated due to technical problem with Q2, Q3 and Q4 Great Britain visitor spend figures. Updated figures have been received by VisitScotland but they are still being verified therefore the figures in Paper 3 remain the same as the previous update.

The long lag time of these figures was raised by the group, questioning how strategic decisions could be made when figures were 18 months old. One example given was how the group could track the impact of Brexit on the sector to ensure that any negative impacts could be mitigated. DC highlighted SE's quarterly surveys of their ~2000 account managed companies, 46 of which are tourism companies<sup>1</sup>. These surveys provide an indication of business confidence, and currently showed little drop in confidence.

AO'C also highlighted VisitScotland's Brand Tracker surveys which measured Scotland's reputation in long-haul, European and GB markets. Recent results suggested that the brand confidence in long-haul and domestic markets remains the same, however has dropped in Europe.

DC and AO'C were asked whether the results of these surveys could be made available to the TLG (in full or summary versions) in order for the group to be better informed of business and consumer confidence. It was felt that this would be the case, however they would check. [NB: HIE Business Panel Survey is already published – see footnote 1].

The confidence of the Visitor Satisfaction measure (NPS) was also discussed. The original baseline measure of 25%, taken from a VS survey had not been updated as the survey was not repeated. The recently published visitor survey used a differently sampling method and therefore could not be used as a comparator. VM was asked whether Tripadvisor figures that are available to VisitScotland as a result of their agreement could be used. VM said that the data was available. Although not an NPS figure, the data would provide a very large sample, continuous longitudinal data, the opportunity to interrogate regional and sectoral differences and also, through sentiment analysis, identify areas of excellence and poor performance.

SD mentioned that Historic Environment Scotland is currently piloting reputation management software [Reputami](#) and could provide more information when available about the merits of the industry adopting this approach.

**Commented [A01]:** Our currently live Brand tracker has questions about Brexit. However, it will be later in summer before we have brand tracker results. Once finalised I am sure these can be shared with TLG. Jacqui Souter is the key lead on the Brand Tracker.

**Commented [A02]:** This mention of our European, long haul & GB markets actually refers to VS's conversion studies, which measure recent trips and future visits to Scotland as a result of VS activity. Plus various other visitor information. It was in our most recent European conversion study we saw a decline on future intentions to visit Scotland. These conversion studies are completed for internal use, particularly to feed into VS's Economic Measurement Framework. However, there would be no issue with sharing any relevant information from the conversion studies with the TLG. It should be caveated that the survey population for the conversion studies is a VS biased audience as we only research people that have engaged with us – thus isn't representative of all visitors to Scotland.

Decisions Asked of Group	Approved?	Comments / Actions	Who?
		TLG requested access to more up-to-date business figures in order to track business confidence in disrupted times. SE/VS/(HIE) to provide full or summarised results to TLG from their business/brand tracking data.	DC / AO'C (CS) / (CT)
		Tripadvisor (TA) figures (via VS) to be considered as visitor satisfaction measure for TS2020. VS to provide TA figures at next TLG meeting which can provide on-going high-level measures of satisfaction as well as the ability to strategically identify weaknesses and gaps and areas of excellence and opportunity.	VM (CS)
		SD to update TLG on Reputami pilot (when pilot is completed).	SD

<sup>1</sup> HIE published a similar study [available here](#).

**3.2 TLG Letters of Appointment:** letters have been sent to all TLG industry members and CW reminded the meeting that a reply confirming each member's continuation on the group is required.

Decisions Asked of Group	Approved?	Comments / Actions	Who?
All TLG members to respond in writing (by email) to acknowledge receipt of Letter of Appointment and confirm continued involvement		The 4 individuals outstanding on this task to confirm. CW to chase.	CW

**3.3 Register of Potential Members:** members were reminded that names need to be put forward by TLG members for this Register. There are up to 5 places available and strategic thinkers from across the visitor economy and from across the country should be considered. A sub-group will review the list, with the intention to bring additional individuals on to the TLG for the September meeting.

Decisions Asked of Group	Approved?	Comments / Actions	Who?
		Names to be proposed for Register of Potential Members.	ALL

**3.4 TS2020 Communications Strategy:** a top level plan was circulated prior to the meeting (Paper 3.2) and was approved without comment. The action plan will now be developed with communications teams within key partner organisations.

Decisions Asked of Group	Approved?	Comments / Actions	Who?
TS2020 Communications Strategy approved.	Y		
Approve development of TS2020 Communications Tactics	Y	CW to report back to STA Communications Team to draft campaign plans	CW

**3.5 Digital Tourism Scotland:** the group discussed the differences in update of DTS in Jan-Mar 2017 across the regions, citing Argyll & Isles and Glasgow. Following a recent review of the DTS, changes to the programme will enable regions greater flexibility in the type of support available to tourism businesses. DTS will focus on inspiring the more digitally experienced part of the sector, and Digital Boost and VisitScotland Digital Review would deal with those with basic skills needs.

## 4. Defining Scottish Tourism

Paper 4 (and Paper 4.1) provided a summary and explanation (and supporting figures) of the key economic figures available for the tourism industry in Scotland. CW talked the group through the paper and the following key points were noted (in no particular order):

- Appreciation of the quality of the papers and the level of work involved to prepare them.
- There is likely to be a requirement for the TLG to have access to figures not publicly included in the final published narrative to enable the group to have a more nuanced and detailed understanding of the opportunities and risks to the sector.
- Whereas the narrative should be concise, additional briefing papers linked directly to the narrative may be required to provide more detail around specific measures and explore what factors might influence them (and therefore the impact on tourism's contribution to the economy). Examples of such themes might be productivity, employment/skills, exports and international markets.
- The Scottish Government definition of tourism (by SIC Codes) yielded different figures from the International definition and in particular excluded 'activities of exhibition and fair organisers' and 'activities of conference organisers' (which are key elements of the Business Tourism sector). Further work is required to look at the degree to which the data can be used to calculate the relative values for different sectors in tourism (such as the TS2020 assets, i.e. business tourism, events & festivals, heritage etc).

- Tourism export figures needed to be added to the narrative (in comparison to other sectors). VS/SE to provide validated and comparative export figures.
- There needs to be further consideration of the narrative relating to tourism's contribution to employment, in particular its role in moving people from welfare to employment (route to employment). CW to speak to Skills Development Scotland to see whether such figures are available.
- There needs to be further consideration of the sector's reach into the rural economy and the relative importance of this.

It was agreed that the final narrative should:

- Be a **concise national overview** with headline figures and a limited degree of interpretation which helps the reader understand the contribution of the sector;
- Aimed at those interested in the national contribution however should point to regional (and sectoral as appropriate) significance if appropriate.
- Be a clear statement of the published facts;
- Have clear links back to the original data to ensure transparency;
- Be able to be easily adapted (and updated) for different audiences, such as Scottish and UK Governments and Local Authorities.
- Be accepted by all TLG partners who would also agree to use the figures.
- Be approved by TLG (by email) by end of July 2017.

Once completed the TLG's focus should be on identifying the opportunities which will influence the sector's economic contribution. This would centre on Input-Output modelling and worked-through examples will be developed in advance of the next TLG meeting.

The small working group established to draft the narrative and comprising of Scottish Enterprise (DC), VisitScotland (CS), Scottish Government (BS), Highlands & Islands Enterprise (CT), STA (CW) and an industry representative (GD) would oversee this work.

Decisions Asked of Group	Approved?	Comments / Actions	Who?
Do the papers provide sufficient information/evidence to write a new economic narrative for tourism?	Y	'International Exports' data to be added 'Route to Employment' figures to be added	DC / AO'C CW (SDS)
If so, what are the key messages we should use to write the narrative?		Final narrative to be drafted  Approval by TLG before end of July.	Narrative Sub-group ALL
How should the narrative be presented and for whom?		Relative contributions of sub-sectoral data to be looked at.  [For discussion at next TLG meeting]. Examples using Input-Output model to show how economic interventions would influence top level figures.	Narrative Sub-group (AO'C)

## 5. Tourism Mega-Trends Impacting to 2030

MC welcomed Jem Golden and Caroline Bremner from Euromonitor International who presented a summary of initial trends to 2030 which they have identified as part of Phase 1 of this Scottish Enterprise project. The presentation is circulated with the note of the meeting.

Due to over-run of previous item, the discussion were curtailed however comments included:

- Asked for reassurance that the trends provided are *the* most relevant trends for Scotland;
- Is there scope to consider the impact of some of the risks facing Scotland up to 2030 (such as rise of the Gig Economy, hard Brexit, terrorism etc affecting Scotland's key markets, global markets etc)?

The next stage is to further explore a sub-set of the trends in more detail and provide recommendation to Scottish Enterprise on opportunities for Scotland. The findings will be shared with the TLG.

Decisions Asked of Group	Approved?	Comments / Actions	Who?
		Final recommendations from the research to be circulated to TLG when published.	CW

## 6. AOB

**UK Tourism Industry Council Paper:** Paper 6 was circulated to the group for information, in particular in context of previous two agenda items. No comments were sought.

---

### Dates of Next Meetings

Tues 26<sup>th</sup> September, Edinburgh, 1pm – 4.30pm

Thurs 30<sup>th</sup> November, Edinburgh, 9.30am – 12.30pm